

**REVIEW**  
**of the official reviewer for dissertation work**  
**Moldabekova Aisulu Tursynbayevna on the theme "Improving quality**  
**of logistics services of dry ports within Eurasian transport corridors**

**(based on the case study "Khorgos Gateway")" presented for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the specialty 6D090900 – Logistics**

№	Criteria	Eligibility (one of the options must be checked)	Justification of the position of the official reviewer
1.	The topic of the thesis (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of development of science and/or state programs	1.1 Compliance with priority areas of science development or government programs: 1) The thesis was completed within the framework of a project or target program financed from the state budget (indicate the name and number of the project or program) 2) The thesis was completed within the framework of another state program (indicate the name of the program) 3) The dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of the development of science, approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (indicate the direction)	Based on the evidence provided, the thesis is aligned with the government agenda.
2.	Importance for science	The work makes/ <del>does not make</del> a significant contribution to science, and its importance is well disclosed/ <del>not disclosed</del>	Dry port research especially in the world largest landlocked country is significantly important. The thesis has covered the service quality advancement in dry ports, the importance of transport corridors in dry port and the infusion of digitalization in the dry port operations. The concept to increase the quality of logistics service in this country is in high demand due to the geographical factor.
3.	The principle of independence	Self-reliance level: 1) High; <del>2) Medium;</del> 3) Low;	Most of the published papers the researcher has taken the responsibility to be the first author. This indicates the significant responsibility and possessing the ability to conduct the research independently.

		<del>4) No independence</del>	
4.	The principle of inner unity	4.1 Justification of the relevance of the thesis: 1) Justified; <del>2) Partially justified;</del> <del>3) Not justified.</del>	The rationalization of the thesis can be seen in the first chapter. The information on relevance of topic, connection of thesis with current research agenda, purpose and objective of the research have present consistently.
		4.2 The content of the thesis reflects the topic of the thesis: 1) Reflects; <del>2) Partially reflects;</del> <del>3) Does not reflect</del>	In general, the content of the thesis has been presented with substantial evidences. Chapter 1 indicating the method that have employed in this research. However, the space for theory is remain unclear in this section. The development of conceptual framework will be suggested in this chapter. The remaining chapters have reflected the content clearly.
		4.3. The purpose and objectives correspond to the topic of the thesis: 1) correspond; <del>2) partially correspond;</del> <del>3) do not correspond</del>	The purpose and objectives is corresponding to the topic of the research. The objectives of the research have been carefully organized in each chapter so that it can be achieved accordingly.
		4.4 All sections and provisions of the thesis are logically interconnected: 1) completely interconnected; <del>2) the interconnection is partial;</del> <del>3) there is no interconnection</del>	The content in the thesis is logically interrelated. However, the problem statement of the research is not strong. I would suggest the candidate to add some problem statement so that the content of each chapter can be justified.
		4.5 The new solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are reasoned and evaluated in comparison with the known solutions: 1) there is a critical analysis; <del>2) partial analysis;</del> <del>3) the analysis does not represent one's own opinions, but quotes from other authors</del>	I would say the candidate has done a detailed independent research to explore a new paradigm in a dry port research especially in Eurasian transport corridors.
5.	Scientific novelty principle	5.1 Are the scientific results and provisions new? <del>1) completely new;</del> 2) partially new (25-75% are new); <del>3) not new (less than 25% are new)</del>	As indicated so far, the research has been presented with well justified evidence and proofs its novelty and the expansion of the knowledge. The novelty of the research is expressed following ways:  i. Clear objectives and well design content, ii. Robust methodology has been employed to meet the research

			<p>questions,</p> <p>iii. Exploring the nation dry ports logistics services as an international agenda,</p> <p>iv. Clearly indicates the contribution of the research</p>
		<p>5.2 Are the dissertation findings new?</p> <p>1) <del>completely new</del>;</p> <p>2) partially new (25-75% are new);</p> <p>3) <del>not new (less than 25% are new)</del></p>	<p>This research filling the gap from the geographical perspective. The case study on Kazakhstan with relation to Eurasian transport corridor reflecting the freight system in unable to perform independently and it requires a supporting component to be more effective.</p>
		<p>5.3 Technical, technological, economic or management decisions are new and reasonable:</p> <p>1) <del>completely new</del>;</p> <p>2) partially new (25-75% are new);</p> <p>3) <del>not new (less than 25% are new)</del></p>	<p>Technical, technological, economic or management decisions have been portrayed in the findings. It is proven that the thesis has been contributed to the development or expansion of the knowledge from these 4 elements.</p>
6.	The validity of the main findings	<p>All main conclusions are/are not based on scientifically significant evidence or well-grounded (for qualitative research and areas of training in the arts and humanities)</p>	<p>The conclusion is written well and the content in this section has been well-grounded based on the proposed objectives. The rationalization of the research objectives, methodology, findings and conclusion has been done very well.</p>
7.	The main provisions for the defense	<p>It is necessary to answer the following questions for each provision separately:</p> <p>7.1 Is the provision proven?</p> <p>1) proven;</p> <p>2) rather proven;</p> <p>3) rather not proven;</p> <p>4) not proven</p> <p>7.2 Is it trivial?</p> <p>1) yes;</p> <p>2) no</p> <p>7.3 Is it new?</p> <p>1) yes;</p> <p>2) no</p> <p>7.4 Application level:</p> <p>1) narrow;</p>	<p>The candidate outlined six scientific provisions:</p> <p><i>The body of knowledge has been demonstrated clearly based on the recent literature, geopolitical needs and international agenda.</i></p> <p><i>The contribution of the research is significant for managerial, academic and technological.</i></p> <p><i>The outcome of the thesis is new especially to Eurasian nations.</i></p> <p><i>The thesis owns a wide range of application level.</i></p> <p><i>The result has been proven in the published articles.</i></p> <p>1) A dry port in continental transport corridors is a logistics node (terminal, centre, hub) in a land transport corridor and provides a wide range of transport and warehouse services, as well as other value-added services, while ensuring the quality of service and digital transparency of the processes.</p> <p>7.1 Is the provision proven?</p> <p><b>1) proven;</b></p> <p>2) rather proven;</p>

		<p>2) medium;  3) wide  7.5 Is it proven in the article?  1) yes;  2) no</p>	<p>3) rather not proven;  4) not proven  7.2 Is it trivial?  1) yes;  <b>2) no</b>  7.3 Is it new?  <b>1) yes;</b>  2) no  7.4 Application level:  1) narrow;  2) medium;  3) <b>wide</b>  7.5 Is it proven in the article?  <b>1) yes;</b>  2) no  Moldabekova A., Beifert A., Sabden O. Logistics Service Quality of Dry Ports Within Land-Based Transport Corridors: A Case Study «Khorgos Gateways» // Lecture Notes in Networks and Systems. – 2020. – Vol. 117. – 213–222 p. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-44610-9_21">https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-44610-9_21</a></p> <p>2) The role of digital technologies in improving the quality of logistics services with the provision of operational data, ensuring transparency of the supply chain, optimizing logistics processes, establishing a flexible connection between products and services, and facilitating instant communication between various stakeholders in the provision of logistics services are substantiated.</p> <p>7.1 Is the provision proven?  <b>1) proven;</b>  2) rather proven;  3) rather not proven;  4) not proven  7.2 Is it trivial?  1) yes;  <b>2) no</b>  7.3 Is it new?</p>
--	--	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

			<p><b>1) yes;</b>  2) no  7.4 Application level:  1) narrow;  2) medium;  <b>3) wide</b>  7.5 Is it proven in the article?  <b>1) yes;</b>  2) no</p> <p>Moldabekova, A., Zhidebekkyzy, A., Akhmetkaliyeva, S., Baimukhanbetova, E. Advanced technologies in improving the management of logistics services: Bibliometric network analysis // Polish Journal of Management Studies. – 2020. – Vol. 21. – № 1. – P. 211–223. <a href="https://doi.org/10.17512/pjms.2020.21.1.16">https://doi.org/10.17512/pjms.2020.21.1.16</a></p> <p>2) A systematic approach to assessing the quality of the logistics service of dry ports in international transport corridors is defined, which implies complexity: at the macro level, an assessment of the factors influencing the logistics service, at the meso level - an analysis of the country's transit potential and application of digital technologies, at the micro level - an assessment of the quality of the logistics service of the dry port. An assessment tool for evaluating the quality of the logistics service of dry ports has been developed, which consists of the following parameters: availability of physical infrastructure, operations and processes quality, management and staff quality, appropriating price for the service quality, comprehensive use of ICT, multimodality, and providing value-added services.</p> <p>7.1 Is the provision proven?  <b>1) proven;</b>  2) rather proven;  3) rather not proven;  4) not proven  7.2 Is it trivial?  1) yes;</p>
--	--	--	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

			<p><b>2) no</b>  7.3 Is it new?  <b>1) yes;</b>  2) no  7.4 Application level:  1) narrow;  2) medium;  <b>3) wide</b>  7.5 Is it proven in the article?  <b>1) yes;</b>  2) no  Moldabekova A., Beifert A., Sabden O. Logistics Service Quality of Dry Ports Within Land-Based Transport Corridors: A Case Study «Khorgos Gateways» // Lecture Notes in Networks and Systems. – 2020. – Vol. 117. – 213–222 p. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-44610-9_21">https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-44610-9_21</a></p> <p>3) Based on the correlation-regression analysis of secondary data, it was revealed that the innovational development, the level of technological readiness of the country and digital technologies have a positive effect on improving the quality of logistics services: trade and transport infrastructure, competence and quality of logistics services, the efficiency of customs clearance processes and cargo tracking.</p> 7.1 Is the provision proven? <b>1) proven;</b> 2) rather proven; 3) rather not proven; 4) not proven 7.2 Is it trivial? 1) yes; <b>2) no</b> 7.3 Is it new? <b>1) yes;</b> 2) no 7.4 Application level:
--	--	--	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

			<p>1) narrow;  2) medium;  <b>3) wide</b>  7.5 Is it proven in the article?  <b>1) yes;</b>  2) no  Moldabekova, A., Philipp, R., Satybaldin, A. A., Prause, G. Technological Readiness and Innovation as Drivers for Logistics 4.0 // Journal of Asian Finance Economics and Business– 2021. – Vol. 8. – № 1. – P. 145–156. <a href="https://doi.org/10.13106/jafeb.2021.vol8.no1.145">https://doi.org/10.13106/jafeb.2021.vol8.no1.145</a>  Moldabekova A., Philipp R., Reimers H. E., Alikozhayev B. Digital Technologies for Improving Logistics Performance of Countries //Transport and Telecommunication Journal – Vol.22 – No.2. – 2021. – P. 207-216. <a href="https://DOI:10.2478/ttj-2021-0016">https://DOI:10.2478/ttj-2021-0016</a></p> <p>4) The analysis of the transit potential and the case study of the dry port "Khorgos Gateway" showed that a high level of logistics services would be achieved due to the digital modernization of the transport and logistics infrastructure. In developing logistics and economic corridors in the Eurasian space, the development of dry ports of international significance and technological, digital modernization of cross-border infrastructure (stations, customs, ports, terminals) would increase the transit potential of countries.</p> <p>7.1 Is the provision proven?  <b>1) proven;</b>  2) rather proven;  3) rather not proven;  4) not proven  7.2 Is it trivial?  1) yes;  <b>2) no</b>  7.3 Is it new?  <b>1) yes;</b>  2) no  7.4 Application level:</p>
--	--	--	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

			<p>1) narrow;  2) medium;  <b>3) wide</b></p> <p>7.5 Is it proven in the article?  <b>1) yes;</b>  2) no</p> <p>Moldabekova A., Beifert A., Sabden O. Logistics Service Quality of Dry Ports Within Land-Based Transport Corridors: A Case Study «Khorgos Gateways» // Lecture Notes in Networks and Systems. – 2020. – Vol. 117. – 213–222 p. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-44610-9_21">https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-44610-9_21</a></p> <p>5) Developed recommendations on improving the quality of logistics services of dry ports and Eurasian transport corridors based on (1) ensuring the quality of logistics services with the introduction of the ISO international service quality standard and the provision of value-added services; (2) digital transformation based on the digital audit of the dry port, the introduction of digital technologies, the development of an integrated information system/platform; (3) integration into regional, international transport networks based on the development of a "soft" infrastructure of transport corridors, involvement in the regional and global chain, development as a logistics hub.</p> <p>7.1 Is the provision proven?  <b>1) proven;</b>  2) rather proven;  3) rather not proven;  4) not proven</p> <p>7.2 Is it trivial?  1) yes;  <b>2) no</b></p> <p>7.3 Is it new?  <b>1) yes;</b>  2) no</p> <p>7.4 Application level:  1) narrow;  2) medium;</p>
--	--	--	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------



			<p><b>3) wide</b></p> <p>7.5 Is it proven in the article?</p> <p><b>1) yes</b></p> <p>2) no</p> <p>Philipp R., Gerlitz L., Moldabekova A. Small and Medium-Sized Seaports on the Digital Track: Tracing Digitalisation Across the South Baltic Region by Innovative Auditing Procedures // Reliability and Statistics in Transportation and Communication. Lecture Notes in Networks and Systems. - Springer, Cham, 2020. - Volume 117. – P. 351-362. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-44610-9_35">https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-44610-9_35</a></p> <p>Moldabekova A., Beifert A., Sabden O. Logistics Service Quality of Dry Ports Within Land-Based Transport Corridors: A Case Study «Khorgos Gateways» // Lecture Notes in Networks and Systems. – 2020. – Vol. 117. – 213–222 p. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-44610-9_21">https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-44610-9_21</a></p>
8.	The principle of reliability Reliability of sources and information provided	<p>8.1 Choice of methodology - is justified or the methodology is described in sufficient detail</p> <p>1) yes; 2) <del>no</del></p>	<p>The methodology has been well executed in this research. As an additional point, the procedure, justification, sampling strategy and mixing point can be included to make the thesis more solid from the methodological perspective.</p> <p>Further, the Common Method Bias (CMB) is suggested to ensure there is no significant biasness between qualitative and quantitative outcomes.</p>
		<p>8.2 The results of the thesis were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and methods of processing and interpreting data using computer technologies:</p> <p>1) yes; 2) <del>no</del></p>	<p>Software have been adopted to analyse the result for proposed objectives.</p>
		<p>8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships and patterns have been proven and confirmed by experimental research (for areas of training in pedagogical sciences, the results have been proven on the basis of a pedagogical experiment):</p>	<p>The commencement of the research and the development of its central argument have been proven and confirmed concerning the execution of each of the research aims and objectives identified in the study.</p>

		1) yes; 2) <del>no</del>	
		8.4 Important statements are confirmed <del>/partially confirmed / not confirmed</del> by references to current and reliable scientific literature	The statements are confirmed and authenticated by literature. The informed and well-read nature of the research is evidenced by the reference list containing the leading material in the literature.
		8.5 Used literature sources are sufficient/ <del>not sufficient</del> for a literature review	The usage of literature to support the motivation and result are sufficient. However, referring to motivation of the research, most of the literature were based on political view some academic are suggested
9	Practical value principle	9.1 The thesis has theoretical value: 1) yes; 2) <del>no</del>	The research has been developed based on the quality of logistics services of dry ports. The results and findings of this research are expected to inform the new academic studies that can be utilise for the managerial contribution.
		9.2 The thesis is of practical importance and there is a high probability of applying the results obtained in practice: 1) yes; 2) <del>no</del>	The outcome of the thesis can be applied to improve the logistics service quality especially in dry port sectors.
		9.3 Are the practice suggestions new? 1) <del>completely new;</del> 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) <del>not new (less than 25% are new)</del>	There is significant novelty that has been identified especially on the managerial and academic as well as technological contributions
10.	The quality of writing and design	Academic writing quality: 1) <del>high;</del> 2) average; 3) <del>below average;</del> 4) <del>low.</del>	The candidate demonstrated a well-written academic quality throughout the thesis especially for addressing the motivation of the research, justifying the methodology and theoretical requirements as well as demonstrating the result of the thesis.

In reviews, official reviewers indicate one of the following solutions:

1) to award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) or Doctor of Specialization;

2) send the thesis for revision (except for cases of thesis defense in the form of a series of articles);

3) refuse to award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) or Doctor of Specialization.

Copies of the reviews of the official reviewers are handed over to the doctoral student no later than 5 (five) working days before the defense of the thesis.

**Official Reviewer:**

Assoc Prof Dr.

Universiti Malaysia Terengganu

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'Jagan Jeevan', with a large loop on the left and a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

JAGAN JEEVAN